

EPSOM HOSPITAL SITE, DORKING ROAD, EPSOM, KT18 7EG
Built Heritage Summary on behalf of Senior Living Urban (Epsom) Limited
LPA reference: 19/01722/FUL & 21/00252/FUL Appeal reference: APP/P3610/W/21/3272074 & APP/P3610/W/21/3276483

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Donald Insall Associates (DIA) were appointed by Senior Urban Living (Epsom) Ltd in 2019 to provide built heritage advice and produce Heritage, Townscape and Visual Impact Assessments to accompany both applications (LPA references 19/01722/FUL and 21/00252/FUL) which are the subject of this conjoined Appeal. This note provides a summary of DIA's findings in relation to built heritage and has been prepared by me, Helen Warren, a Senior Historic Buildings Advisor at DIA, who has worked on the project since 2019. This note does not provide a summary of DIA's findings in relation to townscape because this topic is being dealt with in this Appeal through the detailed evidence of Mr Williams. Graduating with first class honours in 2009, I also hold an MSt in Building History from the University of Cambridge, and am a full member of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation (IHBC). DIA's investigation has comprised historical research and an inspection of the Appeal Site and the surroundings. The investigation has identified and established the significance of the heritage assets potentially affected by the proposals and assessed the impact of both Schemes upon that significance according to relevant legislation, planning policy and guidance. Where an impact is considered to be harmful the assessment categorises it as either less than substantial or substantial harm in accordance with the terminology of the NPPF (2019). Furthermore, in accordance with the approach outlined in the Secretary of State's judgement on the land at Citroen Site, Capital Interchange Way, Brentford (Ref: 3226914, paragraph 6.28) and the Planning Practice Guidance (paragraph 018 reference ID:18a-018-20190723), we note where the harm falls within the less than substantial spectrum.

1.2 The Appeal Site does not contain any designated heritage assets, nor does it lie within a conservation area. None of the buildings on the Appeal Site have been identified by Epsom & Ewell Borough Council as suitable for inclusion on any local list and therefore are not considered by either party to be a 'non-designated heritage asset' under the meaning of the NPPF. All of the current buildings and structures on the Appeal Site have been approved for demolition (planning reference 20/01322/DEM). The assessment therefore was limited to heritage assets found in the surrounding area which may be affected as a result of changes to their settings.

2.0 Appeal A including Wheatcroft Amendments

2.1 Outside of the Appeal Site, 57 listed buildings/structures, the Chalk Lane Conservation Area and the Woodcote Conservation Area are located within a 500m search radius. The majority of these heritage assets would not be affected as a result of the Appeal Site's development due to a lack of intervisibility and a lack of known historical functional association. Of the original 57 identified, the following heritage assets and their settings were considered in further detail in the submitted HTVIA:

- Chalk Lane Conservation Area (including locally listed and positive buildings identified within it)
- Woodcote Conservation Area (including locally listed and positive buildings identified within it)
- Barn behind Nos 1 & 8 (Axwood) Grade II List UID: 1288643
- Woodcote House Grade II List UID: 1214288
- Woodcote Green House Grade II* List UID 1214289
- Westgate House Grade II List UID: 1028573
- Woodcote Villa Grade II List UID: 1288656
- 10 Woodcote Road Grade II List UID: 1214353
- 9 & 11 Woodcote Road Grade II List UID: 1288645
- Service Block to Westcote End House Grade II List UID: 1214352
- Queen Anne House and Woodcote End House Grade II* List UID: 1288644
- 2 and 4 Chalk Lane Grade II List UID: 1028577, 6 Chalk Lane Grade II List UID: 1378219, 8 and 10 Chalk Lane Grade II List UID: 1028578, 12 and 14 Chalk Lane Grade II List UID: 1378220, 5 Chalk Lane Grade II List UID: 1028574,
- Stable Block to Woodcote Grove Grade II List UID: 1028575
- Clock House, Grade II List UID: 1044742
- The Bell House Grade II List UID: 1246206
- East lodge to south west of clock house lodge to south west of clock house Grade II List UID: 1246205

- The White Horse Public House Grade II List UID: 1232220
- 67-69 Dorking Road Grade II List UID: 1378248
- The Hylands Grade II* List UID: 1044739
- Hylands House Grade II* List UID: 1044740
- West Hylands Grade II List UID: 1378249

2.2 Upon detailed consideration within the HTVIA many of these assets were considered not be affected by the Proposed Development. This note does not repeat the findings of the HTVIAs in respect of such assets. Those assets whose significance was deemed to be affected are discussed below.

2.3 Significance of Chalk Lane Conservation Area (including positive buildings within it)¹

The Conservation Area contains a variety of building types, including polite, grand residences set within private grounds alongside modest cottages. Many of the buildings relate to the development of Epsom as a Spa destination from the 17th century onwards and the famous Epsom Race Course.² These buildings provide a variety of architectural and historic interest, combining handsome, red brick and stuccoed facades with smaller scale weather-boarded, vernacular dwellings. The combination of residential buildings set along narrow lanes, with red brick boundary walls and verdant gardens, defines the character and appearance of the area. Cartographic material shows how the area was originally separate from the historic core of the town, with individual, grand houses set within large grounds, surrounded by fields, and cottages built as ribbon development along the main routes. This setting has changed considerably to the north and west of the area, as a result of the expansion of the workhouse site (now hospital site) and additional 20th-century residential development on former fields. Today, the Conservation Area has a varied and contrasting, semi-rural setting made up of Epsom Town Centre to the north, sports pitches/grounds, the hospital site and surrounding suburban post-war development to the west, and the rural, wooded landscape of Epsom Downs Race Course to the east and south.

2.4 Due to intervening built form, vegetation and topography, the Appeal Site is not visible from views within the majority of the Conservation Area. However views of the wider hospital site are obtained from the northern end of the designated area, where the large scale buildings already present on the wider hospital site largely screen the Appeal Site at present, however the tall chimney stack belonging to the former laundry is visible. Views towards the Appeal Site from the western edge of the Conservation Area along Woodcote Green Road contain views of the verdant Millennium Park to the left, two storey residential properties lining the road to the right, with the side elevations and roofscape of the existing 1930s building and tall brick chimney within the Appeal Site visible beyond. At present, the Appeal Site makes a no meaningful contribution to the significance of the conservation area given that it is largely hidden from view.

2.5 Impact of Proposed Development on Chalk Lane Conservation Area

The Proposed Development would not be readily noticeable from the majority of spaces within the Conservation Area, which derives its character and appearance, as well as its overall significance, from the historic and architectural value of the properties within the area, the morphology of the settlement which largely relates to ribbon development along the roads and its semi-rural setting to the south and east; all of which would be unaffected by the proposals. The Proposed Development would introduce a contemporary form and additional height and massing into a small number of views from the area towards its setting to the north and north-west, which would further erode the sense of the asset's once semi-rural setting and cause less than substantial harm. The Conservation Area's setting to the north and north-west has already undergone considerable change which has lessened the contribution it makes to the asset's significance. Given this, the level of harm is considered to fall **at the low end of the less than substantial harm spectrum.**

2.6 Significance of Westgate House (Grade II Listed)

Westgate House is dated to 1684 (date inscribed on staircase ceiling), although is much altered. The former hotel has a central, three-storey core which is flanked by two storeyed wings. 19th-century cartographic material shows

¹ This area is referred to incorrectly as Salt Lane in the Council's Statement of Case, but it is assumed they mean Chalk Lane

² Epsom & Ewell Borough Council, Chalk Lane Conservation Area Appraisal (2010)

the building with much the same setting as can be experienced today, in terms of its relationship to the road network and other surrounding historic buildings. The wider setting has changed over time, primarily as a result of additional 20th-century residential development on former fields and expansion of the workhouse site (now hospital site). At present, the 1930s buildings at the front of the Appeal Site are visible from the listed building's grounds, with more extensive views of the wider site likely available from the upper floors at the northern end of the building.³ Given the varying types of buildings currently occupying the Appeal Site, which range in age, design and condition, the site makes a varied contribution to the setting of the asset. On balance, due to the standardised design and poor quality of the existing buildings, surrounding infrastructure and car parking, the Appeal Site is considered to make a slightly detrimental contribution to the asset's wider setting and to its significance at present, which is primarily derived from its immediate setting and group value with other buildings within this part of the Conservation Area, in addition to the historic and architectural interest manifest within its built fabric and social history as a former hotel.

2.7 Impact of Proposed Development on Westgate House

The Proposed Development would introduce additional massing and height within its wider setting, which would likely be experienced from views within the building and its immediate vicinity, and which would further erode the sense of the asset's once semi-rural setting. Given that tall, institutional buildings are already present within the area adjacent to the Appeal Site, the impact of the Proposed Development on the building's significance is considered to be low. The Proposed Development would have no impact on the asset's group value with other buildings within this part of the Conservation Area, nor the historic and architectural interest manifest within its built fabric and social history as a former hotel; all of which make a strong contribution to its significance. Given this, the level of harm is considered to fall at the **low end of the less than substantial harm spectrum**.

2.8 Queen Anne House and Woodcote End House (Grade II* Listed) and Service Block (Grade II)

These two houses are attached to each other and associated with a separately listed service block. Given that they form a group and that they share a similar setting, they are considered collectively in order to avoid repetition. The southern, two-storey range known as Woodcote End House dates to the mid-18th century and is built of red brick with a red-tiled roof behind the parapet. The range to the north dates to the late-17th/early-18th century and is called Queen Anne House. This section of the building is also built of red brick and has two storeys plus attics. It is noted in the statutory list description that the interior contains an *'Elliptical entrance hall, coved ceiling and niche in wall facing door, mahogany doors. Octagonal room to South with "Adam" ceiling and walls and fireplace. Room to garden with panelled plaster ceiling. Original staircase with delicate fluted balusters and carved brackets.'*⁴ The 18th century, one-storey service block is built of brick and was designed to address the main house, facing north, away from the Appeal Site with limited fenestration. The buildings are set back from Woodcote Road behind stone capped, red-brick walls and private gardens containing several mature trees. Further trees and vegetation line the pavement opposite also. 19th-century cartographic material shows that the buildings were, at this time, surrounded by undeveloped fields to the immediate north, east and south, with the workhouse and other smaller scale development beyond. This wider setting has changed over time with use of sports pitches, car parking, the general development of the hospital site and additional residential development. As a result of this, the contribution made by the asset's wider setting to the north to its significance has been eroded.

2.9 The asset's significance is principally derived from the group value and interrelationships between the principal buildings and their associated service buildings, the historic association with Rev. Martin Madan (1726-1790) and the historic and architectural interest manifest within the built fabric. The buildings' immediate setting within private gardens and the wider Chalk Lane Conservation Area is considered to contribute to their significance.

2.10 Impact of Proposed Development on Queen Anne & Woodcote End House and Service Block

Whilst long distance views from within the grounds and ground floor rooms are likely to be heavily restricted by the intervening boundary wall and tree screening, it is possible that the wider hospital site is visible in views from the upper floors of the house. The Proposed Development may therefore introduce additional height and massing

³ No buildings were inspected internally and therefore all comments within this document on potential views from within listed buildings are based on assumption.

⁴ <https://historicengland.org.uk/listing/the-list/list-entry/1288644>

which would only be glimpsed behind the existing built form on the hospital site from the upper floors of the house, which would further erode the sense of the asset's once, semi-rural setting. It is anticipated that no harm would be caused to the separately listed service block. It is considered that the Proposed Development would have a negligible impact on the significance of Queen Anne and Woodcote End House, which is principally derived from the group value and interrelationships between the principal buildings and their associated service buildings, the historic association with Madan and the historic and architectural interest manifest within their built fabric, rather than its setting to the north which has already been heavily altered. **There would be a negligible, i.e. almost imperceptible level of less than substantial harm.**

2.11 67-69 Dorking Road (Grade II Listed), The White Horse Public House (Grade II Listed), The Hylands (Grade II* Listed), Hylands House (Grade II* Listed) & West Hylands (Grade II Listed)

These designated heritage assets are noted in their list descriptions to form a group. Given this, and that they share a similar setting, they are considered collectively in order to avoid repetition. The White Horse has a long history as a public house. It was originally called The New Inn and dates to the late-17th century with a 19th-century colour-washed brick frontage. It is a two-storey, timber-framed building with a hipped, slate roof hidden behind a parapet and has a series of side extensions. 67-69 Dorking Road are a pair of semi-detached, two-storey, 18th-century cottages. Both cottages are clad in painted weatherboarding and have casement windows, small bay windows to the ground floor and plank front doors. The cottages have a tiled roof and a central chimney stack. The Hylands dates to the mid-18th century. It is a two-storey building, built of red brick with a slightly recessed central section. The statutory list description notes that the interior contains an entrance hall which extends to the depth of the house with a central staircase with turned balusters, carved brackets and a gallery supported on columns. Several 17th- and 18th-century mantelpieces and grates and bolection moulded panelling are also noted. The Grade II-listed West Hylands is likely of a late-17th century date. It is a two-storey, red-brick (although partly rendered) building with a wooden, modillioned cornice at eaves height. Hyland House dates to circa 1740. It is a three-storey building with a mansard roof, built of stock brick with red-brick dressings which is flanked by later, two-storey, canted brick bays, designed in a similar style to the main house. The statutory list description notes that the interior contains *'Original staircase with open string, carved brackets and twisted balusters. West ground floor room has marble chimneypiece and glazed china cupboard, panelled walls. East front room also with marble chimneypiece.'*¹⁵

2.12 These buildings were all built to address the Dorking Road at the point where the first tracks to the first wells in the area diverged. The White Horse has a back of pavement position, while the other assets are set back from the road either behind grass verges, front gardens planted with mature trees, brick walls and/or railings. All of the buildings, save for the pub, have back gardens, with that of Hylands House being a larger formal garden extending southwards behind all of the others. The earliest cartographic material found shows that in the mid-19th century these buildings were largely surrounded by undeveloped field parcels, pockets of development lining the Dorking Road and the workhouse. Over the years, the surrounding, undeveloped land has been developed for residential housing and the expansion of the workhouse and later hospital site. The buildings' significance is principally derived from the historic and architectural interest manifest within their built fabric and their group value. The buildings' immediate settings adjacent to Dorking Road and within their own gardens is considered to contribute to their significance. However, their wider setting, including the Appeal Site and wider hospital site, has seen high levels of development and alteration, and as a result the contribution to its significance has been eroded.

2.13 Impact of Proposed Development on 67-69 Dorking Road, The White Horse Public House, The Hylands, Hylands House & West Hylands

The Proposed Development will introduce additional height and massing into the setting of these buildings which will possibly be visible within views from inside the buildings and potentially their rear gardens, and which would further erode the sense of their once, semi-rural setting. The assets' wider setting, including the Appeal Site, has already seen high levels of development and alteration. Given this, the level of harm is considered to fall at **the low end of the less than substantial harm spectrum.**

3.0 Appeal B

¹⁵ <https://historicengland.org.uk/listing/the-list/list-entry/1044740>

3.1 In heritage impact terms, it is hard to differentiate between the two Schemes, given that they will both result in additional height and massing in the setting of the heritage assets, albeit with one being at a lower level than the other. The alterations presented by Scheme B do not shift the assessment from 'some impact' to 'no impact' and therefore the lowest level of harm identified remains appropriate.

4.0 Conclusion

4.1 The Proposed Development would have no impact on the significance of the majority of the surrounding heritage assets. The exception to this is the setting of the Chalk Lane Conservation Area and the setting of some of the nearby listed buildings which are likely to experience an adverse impact at the lowest end of the less than substantial harm spectrum. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires planning applications to be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The development plan applicable to the site comprises the Core Strategy (2007) and Development Management Policies Document (2015). Decision-makers must also comply with the requirements of the NPPF and Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.